

ISLAMIC TOLERANCE: CONCEPTUALITY, CONTEXTUALITY, PRACTICE

¹N.L.Seitakhmetova, ^{1,2}L.N.Toktarbekova,
³Sh.B.Bidakhmetova, ⁴Y.M.Sharonova

ABSTRACT

The article examines the phenomenon of Islamic tolerance in the context of the value-based cultural paradigm of Islam. Based on sociological studies of the Arab Barometer of Public Opinion of Muslims living in the countries of the Islamic world, the interpretation of tolerance as a key value is given. The authors provide respondents' opinions on problematic issues related to Islamic identity and gender issues. The authors believe that Islamic tolerance is a multifaceted phenomenon that includes spirituality, moral imperatives, and a philosophy of mutual understanding. The article reveals the importance of tolerance for developing dialogue in interfaith relations. The Arab Barometer is a marker of the level of Islamic tolerance. The significance of Islamic tolerance lies in its formation of ideological and tolerant attitudes.

Key words: Islamic Tolerance, Arab Barometer, Islamic Traditions, Culture of Tolerance.

¹Institute for Philosophy, Political Science and Religious Studies of the CS MSHE RK, Almaty, Kazakhstan

²SOAS University of London, London, UK

³Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, Almaty, Kazakhstan

⁴Caspian University, Almaty, Kazakhstan

Author-correspondent:
L.N.Toktarbekova,
lauratoktarbekova@gmail.com

Reference to this article:
Сейтахметова Н.Л.,
Токтарбекова Л.Н.,
Бидакхметова Ш.Б.,
Шаронова Y.M. Islamic
Tolerance: Conceptuality,
Contextuality, Practice //
Adam Alemi. – 2024.
– No.1 (99). – P. 172-179.

Ислам толеранттылығы: концептуалдылық, контекстуалдылық және тәжірибе

Аңдатпа. Мақалада ислам толеранттылығы феномені исламның құндылықтарға негізделген мәдени парадигмасы контекстінде қарастырылады. Ислам әлемі елдерінде тұратын мұсылмандардың қоғамдық пікірінің араб барометрінің әлеуметтанулық зерттеулеріне сүйене отырып, толеранттылық негізгі құндылық ретінде түсіндіріледі. Авторлар респонденттердің ислам бірегейлігі мен гендерлік мәселелерге қатысты күрделі мәселелер бойынша пікірлерін ұсынады. Авторлар ислам толеранттылығы руханилықты, моральдық императивтерді және өзара түсіністік философиясын қамтитын көп қырлы феномен деп санайды. Мақалада конфессияаралық қатынастар тәжірибесінде диалог құру үшін толеранттылықтың маңыздылығы ашылады. Араб барометрі зерттеулері ислам толеранттылығы деңгейін көрсететін маркер болып саналады. Ислам толеранттылығының мәні оның дүниетанымдық толерантты көзқарастарын қалыптастыруда жатыр.

Түйін сөздер: ислам толеранттылығы, Араб Барометрі, ислам дәстүрлері, толеранттылық мәдениеті.

Исламская толерантность: концептуальность, контекстуальность, практика

Аннотация. В статье рассмотрен феномен исламской толерантности в контексте ценностной культурной парадигмы ислама. На основании социологических исследований Арабского барометра общественного мнения мусульман, проживающих в странах Исламского мира дана интерпретация толерантности как ключевой ценности. Авторы приводят мнения респондентов по проблемным вопросам, связанных с исламской идентичностью и гендерными проблемами. Авторы считают, что исламская толерантность является феноменом многогранным, включающим в себя духовность, моральные императивы и философию взаимопонимания. В статье раскрывается значение толерантности для конструирования диалога в практике межконфессиональных отношений. Исследования Арабского Барометра являются маркером, выявляющим уровень исламской толерантности. Значение исламской толерантности заключается в ее формировании мировоззренческих толерантных установках.

Ключевые слова: исламская толерантность, Арабский Барометр, исламские традиции, культура толерантности.

Introduction

The politicisation of the Islamic tradition in recent decades has contributed to the promotion of the ideology of tolerance and intolerance. Tolerance as a concept that took shape in the discourse of the Western Enlightenment from the famous work of John Locke began to be correlated with religious tolerance or religious tolerance. It should be noted, however, that the patience of faith and patience in faith have been fundamental principles in all religious traditions, beginning with Buddhism. In Abrahamic religious traditions, faith acquisition could be accomplished with respect and patience with one's loved one. For example, the historically multi-confessional and multicultural landscape in the Islamic world during the Arab Caliphate period was maintained through the practice of tolerance.

In the Islamic tradition, tolerance is associated with "sabr" and "tasamukh."

The foundations of Islamic tolerance were basic in theological and philosophical discourses. For example, the tafsirs of al-Bukhari [1], Muslims, Abu Dawud and other famous theologians of the Islamic world were particularly important. The modern discourse of Islamic tolerance in the works of D. Esposito [2], T. Assad [3], Hanafi H. [4], Ibrahim T. [5] and others shows the need to reveal modern problems that arise in interfaith and intercultural interaction between the Islamic and Western worlds.

The reconstruction of the experience of Islamic tolerance, which contributes to

overcoming fanaticism, extremism and all kinds of manifestations of religious phobias, should be carried out objectively. Literalism and the formal abstract interpretation of the Islamic tradition of tolerance have been emphasised in some studies by scholars such as Khaled Abu el-Fadl [6] and Mustafa Akyol [7]. They believe that a large number of problems in the construction of dialogue and mutual understanding are contained in the abstract interpretive practice of concepts, contexts, eventfulness, and chronotopes of time.

The study of Islamic tolerance in connection with the transformation of religious, political and cultural processes should be relevant to the present and reflect the demands of both the Muslim and European communities for coexistence and dialogue.

Coercion to tolerance, like "coercion in religion," is not a modern frame since the demand for freedom and the right to pluralism determine and shape public consciousness.

Calls for tolerance will remain just appeals if the policy of tolerance does not become the basis for the formation of culture, science, and art.

Methodology

This article employs the methods of historical reconstruction and sociological interpretation, using the Arab Barometer as a key tool. These methods have allowed us to uncover the integration potential of

Islamic tolerance and the societal need for its implementation. The axiological interpretation of Islamic tolerance reveals its levels in the modern public consciousness, providing insights into the limits and possibilities of tolerance. These findings have practical implications for policymakers interested in fostering interfaith dialogue and understanding.

Main part

Islamic tolerance in sociocultural reality

A just society, which is being formed in the realities of Kazakhstan [8], should be carried out based on spiritual, humanistic traditional experience; one of the critical traditions is the Islamic tradition of tolerance, which has made it possible to preserve the intercultural and interfaith diversity of Kazakhstan.

The conceptualisation of tolerance in post-familiar times is no longer only related to the content of patience and tolerance but also to such phenomena as spirituality, morality, and mercy.

On the territory of Kazakhstan, tolerance had its traditions, since the multicultural landscape was a territory of comfortable coexistence of the traditions of Zoroastrianism, Buddhism, Tengrism, Manichaeism, and early Christianity. For example, the found and interpreted manuscripts in different languages (Parthian, Sogdian, Kipchak, Uighur) demonstrate the presence of other religious traditions in this region and the "presence" of patronage on the part of rulers and societies.

With the advent of Islam, tolerance became a multifaceted phenomenon, the meaning of which, first of all, was associated with a respectful attitude to other religious traditions and religious rituals. This attitude was especially evident in Transoxiana and Muslim Spain. The tradition of tolerance in Muslim Spain was maintained by all strata of society, influencing consolidation. It is necessary to note in the construction of tolerance philosophical, theological treatises such

scholars as Raymond Lully. His well-known work "Conversations of the Three Wise Men" reveals the complementarity of the three Abrahamic religions: Judaism, Christianity and Islam, which coexisted in the space of Islamic Spain. An extended tolerance period contributed to developing the sciences, philosophy, arts, and classical rational theology. The discourse, for example, of Islamic philosophy in Muslim Spain in the works of Ibn Rushd, Ibn Tufail, Ibn Massara, and Ibn Bajji influenced the formation of a culture of tolerance.

In many ways, the tolerant experience of the Islamic world was based on the fundamental principles included in the Constitution of Medina (622) and the Treaty of Hudaibiyya (628). The Medina Constitution proclaimed the rights to freedom of religion and the legal regulation of relations between Muslims and non-Muslims. This Treaty (Constitution) constructed the rights to cultural and religious sovereignty of the religious communities living in Medina. The Khudaybiyya Treaty also opened up prospects for the tolerance of relations in society and the strengthening of ties.

Modern agreements and declarations on tolerance in the Islamic world meet society's needs. For example, the famous Amman Declaration of 2004 outlined the algorithms for the formation of tolerance, answering five essential questions: Islamic identity, Islamic pluralism, Islamic education, enlightenment, Islamic tolerance, and cooperation [9].

Unlike the Cairo Declaration on Human Rights in Islam, the Amman Declaration has not been criticized; on the contrary, it is understood as a frame message for dialogue and mutual understanding.

Declarations of tolerance play an essential role in forming a culture of tolerance in society. In the Islamic world, declarations of tolerance play the same role as fatwas. The polysemantic and, at the same time, the holistic meaning of tolerance in Islam is manifested in legal practice, especially in ijthad, philosophical teachings, and art, in which the continuity and acceptance of different styles and traditions that do not contradict ethical

Islamic norms have been realised.

Tolerance as a communicative practice has been very effective. A particular state's internal political processes facilitated its periodic deconstruction. For example, in Spain, with the advent of the Inquisition, tolerance no longer became a principle of life but a form of protest, a discourse of resistance in defending the right to religion and individual freedom.

An analysis of public opinion in the countries of the Islamic world shows that tolerance is one of the stable components of traditional societies and cultures. As a rule, tolerance as a phenomenon appears in the historical and cultural landscape with a pronounced multicultural or multicultural component. For example, in Kazakhstan, tolerance has been implemented in the sphere of socio-cultural and political life. Sociological studies of tolerance in Kazakhstan demonstrate a high tolerance index in society's cultural, communicative and confessional interactions.

Sociological research of Arab Barometer, based on surveys and interviews in the countries of the Islamic world, are markers for identifying socio-cultural and political situations and the mood called socio-cultural tension, which determines the boundaries of trust in society, confrontations and conflict-prone situations. Socio-cultural tensions include concepts such as religious tension, interfaith tension, and intrafaith tension. All of these types of religious tension contribute to the creation of religious hostility, religious intolerance, and religious conflicts in society.

The interpretation of religious tensions is often related to the problems of interfaith conflicts. In this context, it is necessary to identify the level of religious tolerance in society, focusing on the issue of interaction between religious confessions and their dialogue. The dialogue of religions is the most difficult since it is a dialogue of religious values, traditions, and, finally, different paradigms united by the spiritual factor. It is assumed that in the dialogue of religions, the removal of tension is carried out through understanding and constant renewal of the conditions of dialogue.

Traditional and non-traditional religions, intolerant coexistence, can also produce conditions for tolerance.

The problem of tolerance in Islamic societies is historical and contemporary, and at present, studies of the Religious Tolerance Index show a noticeable increase in tolerance in relations between people.

The Arab Barometer has not conducted a separate study of religious (Islamic) tolerance, but a sociological study of public opinion on gender equality and relations between non-religious and religious people shows the level of tolerance concerning these problems. For example, an analysis of public views conducted by the Arab Barometer over the past five years (2019-2023) in the Middle East and North Africa on women's rights and freedoms, attitudes towards migration processes, and sexual minorities showed that attitudes towards non-religiosity and religious societies have changed, this attitude has become tolerant; moreover, the number of people who consider themselves non-religious has increased to 13% [9].

The issue of women's rights and gender equality was the most "tolerated": respondents (about 50%) expressed the opinion that women can take part in public administration [10]. Concerning the adoption of queer identities, the position of the majority is still intolerant, even in Lebanon, only 6% of respondents expressed their tolerance towards queer communities [10].

The attitude to the problem of emigration and democracy is interesting. Most respondents are optimistic about emigration due to social, political, and economic issues; for example, in connection with leaving the country, every fifth of the respondents agreed to accept and understand the cultural traditions of another country. The attitude towards democratic values is positive; moreover, respondents accept emigration as a choice because of the threat of totalitarian and dictatorial regimes [10].

The Arab Barometer's studies, which are highly appreciated by the scientific community, are a reliable and important source, especially for analyzing a number

of issues related to the Middle East countries. Based on data published by the Arab Barometer, the present report analyses a number of issues related to education, religion, discrimination, and gender studies in the Middle East.

According to the Arab Barometer report (December 19, 2022) [11], in Jordan, the study identified the most critical areas for improving public education: teacher training, reducing class sizes, and improving technology in education. Similarly, in Kuwait, the focus is on teacher training and curriculum renewal. The study also highlights the most pressing problems of the school system, such as overcrowding in classrooms, lack of qualified teachers, outdated technology, crumbling infrastructure and outdated curricula, highlighting the need for public education policy reforms in both Kuwait and Jordan.

Another critical issue is gender equality in education. According to the Arab Barometer report (January 5, 2023) [12], a quarter of Moroccans believe that university education is more important for men than for women. Interestingly, less than one in five women agree with this statement, compared to three in ten men. Kuwaitis fully agree that higher education is more important for men than for women. The answer to the question of whether a man should have the final say in all decisions concerning the family is traditional in Kuwait.

According to the Arab Barometer report (February 20, 2023) [13], nearly two-thirds of Kuwaitis strongly believe that men are better suited for political leadership positions. Although most Tunisians favour quotas for women in the cabinet and parliament, about half still believe that men are better at political leadership than women.

While women's economic empowerment in Morocco is an essential factor in the increasing number of women in employment, the treatment of women in Tunisia has harmed their employability.

In 2022, only about a quarter of women in Tunisia worked, with five of them indicating that women face widespread challenges

on their way to employment. Tunisian responses suggest that the obstacles to increasing women's employment are many and multifaceted. About one in ten women talk about low wages and discriminatory attitudes towards women. Harassment was another serious problem affecting women in many countries, and Tunisia was one of them. About three-quarters of those surveyed say that harassment of women in the workplace is very widespread. This is not just the perception of Tunisian women; men and women are equally inclined to hold this opinion. Moreover, it has been found that women are often prone to harassment on the street. Again, there are no significant differences between male and female survey results in Tunisia on this issue. Finally, there is a consensus that women face almost no domestic violence, with only 14 per cent of Tunisians believing that this is not the case.

First, Moroccans were asked if they agreed that a man should have the final say on all family decisions, and more than half of citizens strongly agreed or agreed with this statement, six points more than in 2018. Strikingly, Moroccan men are 30 per cent more likely to say that a man should have the last word at home than a woman. Secondly, the Arab Barometer conducted a survey of Moroccans about various tasks in the household, such as helping children with their studies, budgeting for the household, and who should be responsible for them. At the same time, they are more likely to say that men should be accountable for budgeting and household expenses.

Only 4 per cent of Kuwaiti citizens believe that the preparation of the family budget and the satisfaction of the family's needs is the sole responsibility of the mother. In Lebanon, the majority of people believe that the family budget and household needs are solely the responsibility of the father, and more than a third of those surveyed believe that home surveys should be shared between the mother and father.

Another important question that opens up the understanding of critical social positions is whether a woman married

to a foreigner can transmit nationality to her children. Almost half of Kuwaitis strongly agree that women married to foreigners should be able to pass on their nationality to their children. According to the Arab Barometer report (26 February 2024; 8 September 2022) [14, 15], almost all Tunisians agree that men and women should have equal rights in deciding whom to marry.

According to the Arab Barometer report (December 19, 2019) [16], nearly a quarter of Yemenis aged 18 to 29 identify as religious, compared to 34 per cent of those aged 60 and older who identify as spiritual. Surprisingly, people with a high school education are somewhat less likely to define themselves as religious. Less than half of Yemenis believe that religious leaders should influence government decisions, lower than in all previous Arab Barometer polls in the country. Seventy-one per cent believe religious leaders should not influence voters, down 20 percentage points from 2010. Meanwhile, 77 per cent of older generations believe religious leaders should not interfere in the affairs of voters, compared to 71 per cent among younger generations. Notably, the level of education is not so closely related to whether religious leaders should be able to influence voters, as roughly the same number of people hold this view with a basic level of education and those with a higher level.

According to the Arab Barometer report (November 14, 2019) [17], In Lebanon, three-quarters of those surveyed believe that religion is a private matter that should be separated from public life, down 13 per cent from 2012. In addition, two in 10 Muslims believe that non-Muslims should have reduced rights in a Muslim-majority country, up 12 per cent from 2010. Seventy-one per cent believe religious leaders should not influence voters, down 20 percentage points from 2010. Only 20 per cent believe religious leaders should influence government decisions, but this level is 11 points higher than in 2012. In addition, two in 10 Muslims believe that non-Muslims should have fewer rights in a Muslim-majority country, up 12 percentage

points from 2010.

The foregoing helps to understand the root causes of the problems in the Middle East.

Sociological studies of tolerance in secular and religious societies show the same answer to the question of what tolerance is. As a rule, most respondents understand tolerance concerning another system of values: worldview, religion, traditions, and customs. The issue of the need to form tolerance in society is significant.

With historical foundations, tolerance in Kazakh society is a value in the value worldview paradigm.

Conclusion

Islamic tolerance is a critical value in the axiological scale of Islamic culture. Studies of public opinion in Islamic societies (on the examples of individual countries of the Islamic world) on several issues such as gender equality, democracy, and education have shown that Muslims express their tolerant attitude on these issues. Gender equality and equal access to education are markers of tolerance for the majority of respondents, and the recognition of the plurality of the world is considered through the context of the diversity of cultural and religious traditions.

Sources of financing

This research was funded by the SC MSHE RK (Grant No. AP19679139 «The Architectonics of Islamic Tolerance in Kazakhstan: the Experience of Communication and Interfaith Dialogue»)

References

- 1 Al-Bukhari M. Al-Adab al-Mufrad. The Prophet's Hadiths on Good Conduct. - St. Petersburg: Dilya Publishing House, 2011. - 544 p. (in Russian).
- 2 Esposito J.L. The Oxford History of Islam. - Oxford University Press, 1999. - 749 p.
- 3 Asad N. Genealogies of Religion: Discipline and Reasons of Power in Christian West: Special Reference to Scholasticism. - Edinburgh

University Press, 1990. - 431 p.

4 Islam in the Modern World. – Cairo: Darkeba Bookshop, 2000. Vol. 1. - 542 p.

5 Towards Qur'anic Tolerance. - Nizhny Novgorod: Medina Publishing House, 2007. - 288 p.

6 Khaled Abou El Fadl. The Place of Tolerance in Islam. - Beacon Press, 2002. - 128 p.

7 Akyol M. Peopening Muslim Minds. A. Return to Reason, Freedom and Tolerance. - St. Martin Essentials. - 336 p.

8 Address of the Head of State Kassym-Jomart Tokayev to the people of Kazakhstan. 2021 // [Electronic source] URL: <https://www.akorda.kz/ru/poslanie-glavy-gosudarstva-kasym-zhmorta-tokaeva-narodu-kazahstana-183048> (the date of referring: 05.09.2023)

9 The Amman Message // [Electronic source] URL: <https://ammanmessage.com/> (the date of referring: 05.09.2023)

10 Source: Arab Barometer. BBC // [Electronic source] URL: [arabbarometer.org](https://www.arabbarometer.org) (the date of referring: 05.09.2023)

11 Arab Barometer (19 December 2022). Report on Jordan. 2021-2022. Education // [Electronic source] URL: https://www.arabbarometer.org/wp-content/uploads/ABVII_Kuwait_Report-ENG.pdf (the date of referring: 05.09.2023)

12 Arab Barometer (5 January 2023). Morocco Situation Report 2021-2022 Gender issue // [Electronic source] URL: https://www.arabbarometer.org/wp-content/uploads/AB-VII_Morocco_Report-ENG.pdf (the date of referring: 05.09.2023)

13 Arab Barometer (20 February 2023). Kuwait State Report 2022. Gender issue. Education, gender and discrimination // [Electronic source] URL: https://www.arabbarometer.org/wp-content/uploads/ABVII_Kuwait_Report-ENG.pdf (the date of referring: 05.09.2023)

14 Arab Barometer (19 December 2019). Yemen: Country Report 2019. Religion // [Electronic source] URL: https://www.arabbarometer.org/wp-content/uploads/Yemen_Public-Opinion_2019.pdf (the date of referring: 05.09.2023)

15 Arab Barometer (26 February 2024). Tunisia: Public Opinion Report 2023. Gender // [Electronic source] URL: https://www.arabbarometer.org/wp-content/uploads/AB-VIII_Tunisia_Report.pdf (the date of referring: 05.09.2023)

16 Arab Barometer (8 September 2022). Report on Tunisia 2021-2022 // [Electronic source] URL: <https://www.arabbarometer.org/wp-content/uploads/AB7-Tunisia-Report-EN.pdf> (the date of referring: 05.09.2023)

17 Arab Barometer (14 November 2019). Lebanon: Country Report 2019. Religion // [Electronic source] URL: <https://www.arabbarometer.org/wp-content/uploads/lebanon-report-Public-Opinion-2019.pdf> (the date of referring: 05.09.2023)

INFORMATION ABOUT AUTHORS

Natalya Seitakhmetova

Chief Researcher, Professor, Doctor of Philosophical Sciences, Corresponding Member of the National Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Institute for Philosophy, Political Science and Religious Studies of the CS MSHE RK, Almaty, Kazakhstan, email: natalieseyt@mail.ru, ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6297-7317>

Laura Toktarbekova

Leading Researcher, PhD, Institute of Philosophy, Political Science and Religious Studies of the CS MSHE RK, Almaty, Kazakhstan, Visiting Researcher of School of Oriental and African Studies (SOAS) University of London, London, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, email: lauratoktarbekova@gmail.com, ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4063-8255>

Shynar Bidakhmetova

PhD student, Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, Almaty, Kazakhstan

Yelizaveta Sharonova

Associate Professor, PhD, Caspian University, Almaty, Kazakhstan

- Наталья Львовна Сейтахметова* бас ғылыми қызметкер, профессор, философия ғылымдарының докторы, ҚР ҰҒА корреспондент мүшесі, ҚР ҒЖБМ ҒК Философия, саясаттану және дінтану институты, Алматы, Қазақстан, email: natalieseyt@mail.ru, ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6297-7317>
- Лаура Ниязбековна Токтарбекова* жетекші ғылыми қызметкер, PhD, ҚР ҒЖБМ ҒК Философия, саясаттану және дінтану институты, Алматы, Қазақстан, Шығыстану және африкатану мектебі Лондон Университетінің шақырылған ғылыми қызметкері, Лондон, Ұлыбритания және Солтүстік Ирландия Біріккен Патшалығы, email: lauratoktarbekova@gmail.com, ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4063-8255>
- Шынар Бидахметқызы Бидахметова* PhD докторант, Әл-Фараби атындағы Қазақ Ұлттық университеті, Алматы, Қазақстан
- Елизавета Михайловна Шаронова* қауымдастырылған профессор, PhD, Каспий Университеті, Алматы, Қазақстан
- Наталья Львовна Сейтахметова* главный научный сотрудник, профессор, доктор философских наук, член-корреспондент НАН РК, Институт философии, политологии и религиоведения КН МНВО РК, Алматы, Казахстан, email: natalieseyt@mail.ru, ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6297-7317>
- Лаура Ниязбековна Токтарбекова* ведущий научный сотрудник, PhD, Институт философии, политологии и религиоведения КН МНВО РК, Алматы, Казахстан, приглашенный научный сотрудник Школы востоковедения и африканистики Лондонского университета, Лондон, Соединенное Королевство Великобритании и Северной Ирландии, email: lauratoktarbekova@gmail.com, ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4063-8255>
- Шынар Бидахметқызы Бидахметова* PhD докторант, Казахский национальный университет имени аль-Фараби, Алматы, Казахстан
- Елизавета Михайловна Шаронова* ассоциированный профессор, PhD, Каспийский университет, Алматы, Казахстан

