

INSTITUTIONAL FOUNDATIONS OF SPIRITUAL AND CULTURAL SECURITY IN TURKIC-SPEAKING COUNTRIES: A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS

M.I.Issayeva¹, E.N. Chermukhambetov²,
D.D. Yeshpanova², A.R.Abdiyeva³

ABSTRACT

Under the conditions of modern globalization, the preservation and protection of universal and national values are important conditions for the sustainable development of states, strengthening national identity and ensuring social stability. Universal values include principles common to all humanity, such as human rights, freedom, justice, equality, peace, and tolerance. National values, on the other hand, are formed on the basis of the historical experience, language, culture, traditions, historical memory and spiritual heritage of a particular people. In this regard, ensuring spiritual and cultural security is considered an important legal mechanism for preserving national values.

The purpose of the study is to analyze the constitutional and legislative foundations of spiritual and cultural security in Turkic-speaking states from a comparative legal perspective, to identify their common features and national characteristics and to determine the legal mechanisms for protecting spiritual and cultural values. The legal experience of Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Uzbekistan, Azerbaijan and Turkmenistan during the period of independence was taken as the object of the study. The methods of comparative law, formal-legal, historical-legal, and systemic analysis were used in the study. The Constitutions of the states and regulatory legal acts related to the protection of language, culture, historical and cultural heritage and national values were analyzed. In addition, the relationship between national legislation with international law and the legal foundations of cultural and humanitarian cooperation were considered.

As a result of the study, it was determined that there are common directions in the constitutional and legal foundations of ensuring spiritual and cultural security in the Turkic-speaking states. At the same time, there are certain differences in the mechanisms of legal regulation due to the historical, political, social and cultural characteristics of each state. The results of the study indicate the importance of further improving legal cooperation between the Turkic states in the field of protecting cultural and spiritual values.

Keywords: Value, Spiritual And Cultural Security, Kazakhstan, Turkic-Speaking States, Comparative Legal Analysis.

¹ International Vision University, Gostivar, North Macedonia

² Institute for Philosophy, Political Science and Religious Studies of the CS MSHE RK, Almaty, Kazakhstan

³ Kazakh-Russian Medical University, Almaty, Kazakhstan

Corresponding author:

M.I. Issayeva,
meiramkul.issayeva@vision.edu.mk

Citation:

Issayeva M.I., Chermukhambetov E.N., Yeshpanova D.D., Abdiyeva A.R. Institutional foundations of spiritual and cultural security in turkic-speaking countries: a comparative analysis // Adam Alemi. – 2026. – Vol. 28. – No. 3 (109). – P. 167–178. – DOI: 10.48010/xq5hy120

Open Access

© The Author(s), 2026
This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License (CC BY 4.0).
<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>

Received: 31/05/2026

Accepted: 05/08/2026

Published online: 30/09/2026

Түркі Тілдес Мемлекеттердегі рухани және мәдени қауіпсіздіктің институционалдық негіздері: салыстырмалы талдау

Аңдатпа. Қазіргі жаһандану жағдайында жалпыадамзаттық және ұлттық құндылықтарды сақтау мен қорғау мемлекеттердің тұрақты дамуының, ұлттық бірегейлікті нығайтудың және әлеуметтік тұрақтылықты қамтамасыз етудің маңызды шарттарының бірі болып табылады. Жалпыадамзаттық құндылықтарға адам құқықтары, бостандық, әділеттілік, теңдік, бейбітшілік және толеранттылық сияқты бүкіл адамзатқа ортақ қағидаттар жатады. Ұлттық құндылықтар белгілі бір халықтың тарихи тәжірибесі, тілі, мәдениеті, дәстүрлері, тарихи жады және рухани мұрасы негізінде қалыптасады. Осы тұрғыдан рухани және мәдени қауіпсіздікті қамтамасыз ету ұлттық құндылықтарды сақтаудың маңызды құқықтық тетігі ретінде қарастырылады.

Зерттеудің мақсаты – түркі тілдес мемлекеттердегі рухани және мәдени қауіпсіздіктің конституциялық-заңнамалық негіздерін салыстырмалы-құқықтық тұрғыдан талдау, олардың ортақ белгілері мен ұлттық ерекшеліктерін айқындау және рухани-мәдени құндылықтарды қорғаудың құқықтық механизмдерін анықтау. Зерттеу объектісі ретінде Қазақстан, Қырғызстан, Өзбекстан, Әзербайжан және Түрікменстанның тәуелсіздік кезеңіндегі құқықтық тәжірибесі алынды. Салыстырмалы-құқықтық, формальды-құқықтық, тарихи-құқықтық және жүйелік талдау әдістері қолданылды. Мемлекеттердің конституциялары, тіл, мәдениет, тарихи-мәдени мұра және ұлттық құндылықтарды қорғауға қатысты нормативтік-құқықтық актілер талданды. Сонымен бірге

ұлттық заңнаманың халықаралық құқықпен байланысы және мәдени-гуманитарлық ынтымақтастықтың құқықтық негіздері қарастырылды.

Зерттеу нәтижесінде түркі тілдес мемлекеттерде рухани және мәдени қауіпсіздікті қамтамасыз етудің конституциялық-құқықтық негіздерінде ортақ бағыттар бар екені анықталды. Сонымен қатар әр мемлекеттің тарихи, саяси, әлеуметтік және мәдени ерекшеліктеріне байланысты құқықтық реттеу тетіктерінде айырмашылықтар бар. Нәтижелер мәдени және рухани құндылықтарды қорғау саласында түркі мемлекеттері арасындағы құқықтық ынтымақтастықты одан әрі жетілдірудің маңызын көрсетеді.

Түйін сөздер: құндылық, рухани және мәдени қауіпсіздік, Қазақстан, түркі тілдес мемлекеттер, салыстырмалы-құқықтық талдау.

Институциональные основы духовной и культурной безопасности в турецкоязычных странах: сравнительный анализ

Аннотация. В условиях современной глобализации сохранение и защита универсальных и национальных ценностей является одним из важных условий устойчивого развития государств, укрепления национальной идентичности и обеспечения социальной стабильности. Универсальные ценности включают принципы, общие для всего человечества, такие как права человека, свобода, справедливость, равенство, мир и толерантность. Национальные ценности, с другой стороны, формируются на основе исторического опыта, языка, культуры, традиций, исторической памяти и духовного наследия конкретного народа. В этой связи обеспечение духовной и культурной безопасности рассматривается как важный правовой механизм сохранения национальных ценностей.

Цель исследования – анализ конституционно-законодательных основ духовной и культурной безопасности в тюркоязычных государствах с сравнительно-правовой точки зрения, выявление их общих черт и национальных особенностей, а также определение правовых механизмов защиты духовных и культурных ценностей. В качестве объекта исследования был взят правовой опыт Казахстана, Кыргызстана, Узбекистана, Азербайджана и Туркменистана в период независимости. В исследовании использованы методы сравнительно-правового, формально-правового, историко-правового и системного анализа. Были проанализированы конституции государств, нормативно-правовые акты, касающиеся защиты языка, культуры, историко-культурного наследия и национальных ценностей. Кроме того, рассмотрены взаимосвязь национального законодательства с международным правом и правовые основы культурного и гуманитарного сотрудничества.

В результате исследования было установлено наличие общих направлений в конституционно-правовых основах обеспечения духовной и культурной безопасности в тюркоязычных государствах. В то же время, существуют определенные различия в механизмах правового регулирования, обусловленные историческими, политическими, социальными и культурными особенностями каждого государства. Результаты исследования указывают на важность дальнейшего совершенствования правового сотрудничества между тюркоязычными государствами в области защиты культурных и духовных ценностей.

Ключевые слова: ценность, духовная и культурная безопасность, Казахстан, тюркоязычные государства, сравнительно-правовой анализ.

Introduction

Values are recognized as a set of norms that change across different historical periods in human history. One important indicator of societal development is the existence of an integrated system in which values are preserved, protected, and developed. In the context of contemporary globalization, preserving national culture and spiritual values has become one of the key directions for ensuring the sustainable development of states and strengthening national identity. Rapid advances in information technologies, cultural globalization, the expansion of transnational communications, and social change place new demands on national languages, historical memory, traditional values, and cultural heritage. In this context, ensuring spiritual and cultural security is regarded not only as an element of cultural policy but also as an important component of state legal policy.

As political actors in world affairs, states with extensive historical experience identify

core values and use them as guiding orientations. In the United States, priority is given to values such as independence, equality, individualism, democracy, nationalism, meritocracy, fairness, innovation, consumerism, informality, and the efficient use of time; in Denmark, social welfare, freedom, trust, equality before the law, gender equality, the Danish language, volunteerism, liberalism/tolerance, and Christian heritage are regarded as key national values; and in the United Kingdom, democracy, the rule of law, respect, tolerance, and individual liberty are recognized as core values [1]. For Turkic-speaking states, the issue has its own specific features. Although Kazakhstan, Türkiye, Azerbaijan, Kyrgyzstan, Uzbekistan, and Turkmenistan are linked by common historical, linguistic, and cultural roots, their state structures, legal systems, and mechanisms for implementing cultural policy differ. A comparative study of the legal foundations of spiritual and cultural security in these states therefore makes it possible to identify both common

and distinctive legal mechanisms for protecting national values. The concept of spiritual and cultural security is closely connected with the protection of the national language, historical and cultural heritage, traditions, national values, and the spiritual integrity of society. States create the relevant legal conditions through constitutional norms, special laws, state programs, and institutional mechanisms aimed at protecting cultural heritage. In particular, language policy, the protection of cultural heritage and historical monuments, support for national traditions, and guarantees of citizens' cultural rights define the legal content of spiritual and cultural security.

The theoretical framework of this study is formed by Pierre Bourdieu's concept of cultural capital, Joseph Nye's theory of soft power, and Eric Hobsbawm's concept of the "invention of tradition". Bourdieu treats cultural capital as an important cultural resource that affects an individual's social position and opportunities [2, p. 62]. Under this approach, a society's cultural resources are not limited to material assets: language, education, cultural experience, historical consciousness, traditions, patterns of social behavior, and cultural skills also constitute important forms of capital. From this perspective, legal protection of national languages, historical and cultural heritage, traditional culture, and spiritual values in Turkic-speaking states is an important mechanism for preserving cultural capital and transmitting it to future generations. The legal foundations of cultural security may therefore be understood as an institutional system that prevents the erosion of national cultural capital. Nye's soft-power concept explains the ability of states to achieve their objectives not through coercion but through culture, values, and persuasion [3, p. 206]. Accordingly, the common historical and cultural heritage of the Turkic states can strengthen mutual humanitarian ties and enhance their cultural influence internationally. Legal protection of cultural heritage, national languages, and spiritual values thus contributes not only to domestic cultural security but also to the formation of a state's soft-power potential. Hobsbawm's concept of the "invention of tradition" shows that some traditions perceived as ancient may in fact have been formed comparatively recently and may serve particular social and cultural purposes; such traditions help consolidate public values and collective identity [4, p. 51]. This perspective is relevant to the

legal regulation of historical memory, national symbols, traditions, and cultural heritage in Turkic-speaking states, because states use legislative and institutional tools to protect particular historical and cultural values and embed them in public consciousness. Considered together, the three approaches reveal the complex nature of spiritual and cultural security: Bourdieu's cultural capital explains cultural resources and their intergenerational transmission; Nye's soft power explains the domestic and international influence of cultural values; and Hobsbawm's invention of tradition explains the formation and institutionalization of traditions and historical memory. From this theoretical standpoint, the legal foundations of spiritual and cultural security in Turkic-speaking states can be viewed not merely as a system for protecting national culture, but as a set of interrelated legal and institutional mechanisms aimed at preserving cultural capital, strengthening national identity, shaping historical memory, and enhancing the cultural influence of the state. This approach provides the theoretical basis for comparing constitutional norms and legislation on culture, language, historical heritage, and national values in Kazakhstan, Türkiye, Azerbaijan, Uzbekistan, Kyrgyzstan, and Turkmenistan.

Materials and Research Methods

The relevance of the study stems from the need for a systematic comparison of the legal mechanisms used to ensure spiritual and cultural security in Turkic-speaking states and for a clearer identification of their common principles and national specificities. The study comparatively analyzes legal norms relating to the protection and development of spiritual and cultural values in Kazakhstan and the Turkic-speaking republics, as well as the security of those values. Since values constitute the spiritual core of any society, states oriented toward development treat the protection of spiritual values as one of their major objectives. Analytical, comparative, critical, comparative-legal, formal-legal, historical-legal, and systemic methods were used. The theoretical and source base consists of the Constitutions and other legislative acts of Kazakhstan and the other Turkic-speaking republics, together with the works of domestic and foreign scholars in state and legal theory, sectoral legal studies, and political science.

Legislative Framework for the Protection of Spiritual and Cultural Values in the Turkic-Speaking Republics

In the first years of independence, the Turkic-speaking republics adopted their own Constitutions, and to this day, several constitutional reforms have been carried out in these countries [5]:

- The Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan was adopted on August 30, 1995, and the latest amendment was made by referendum on June 5, 2022.
- The Constitution of the Republic of Kyrgyzstan was adopted on May 5, 1993, and the new Constitution of the Republic of Kyrgyzstan was last adopted by referendum on May 5, 2021.
- The Constitution of the Republic of Uzbekistan was adopted on December 8, 1992, and the last amendments and additions were made by referendum on May 1, 2023.
- The Constitution of the Republic of Turkmenistan was adopted on May 18, 1992, and a Constitutional reform was carried out on January 23, 2021,
- The Constitution of the Republic of Azerbaijan was adopted on November 12, 1995, and amendments and additions were made through national referendums held on August 24, 2002, March 18, 2009, and September 26, 2016.

Constitutional amendments are the main guideline that determines the direction of the country. The laws and regulatory legal documents adopted in any country are based on this fundamental law, and the foundation of strategic programs, concepts, and doctrines that guide the development of society also originate from this constitution.

As we can see above, the constitutions of the mentioned republics have undergone several significant reforms; however, the most significant changes were the constitutional amendments adopted as a result of the last referendum. As a result of the adopted constitutional amendments, these republics have set a new course for development, as a result of which: Kazakhstan has adopted new Concepts and Doctrines, such as "New Kazakhstan", Uzbekistan "New Uzbekistan", and Kyrgyzstan "Ungu Zhol". These concepts and doctrines include new guidelines for the development of all sectors of the country.

Republic of Kazakhstan. In his Address to the People of Kazakhstan on March 16, 2022,

the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan Kassym-Jomart Tokayev proposed the creation of New Kazakhstan under the theme "New Kazakhstan: the path of renewal and modernization" [6]. The main directions of New Kazakhstan, starting in 2022, including issues of preserving and developing values, are known as priority topics in the texts of the Annual Address of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the text of the Information Doctrine of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and the reports of the National Congress of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

On March 14, 2025, the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan Kassym-Jomart Tokayev also touched upon the topic of national values in his speech at the fourth session of the National Congress. The Head of State noted the need for this document, which will contribute to the promotion of values and the formation of a new quality of the nation, to clearly define the goals, objectives and priorities of the work of the state ideology [7].

The opinion on the preservation of values was expressed by the Head of State Kassym-Jomart Tokayev in his speech at the XXX-III session of the Assembly of the People of Kazakhstan: "I believe that citizens should be guided by the ideals of love for the Motherland, patriotism, and respect for the culture, customs, and traditions of our people" [8]. In addition, at the Kurultai session in Atyrau, President Kassym-Jomart Tokayev noted the following as the guidelines that society should adhere to in all spheres: [7]:

1. Independence and Patriotism.
2. Unity and Solidarity.
3. Justice and Responsibility.
4. Law and Order.
5. Hard Work and Professionalism.
6. Creativity and Innovation.

Kyrgyz Republic. In order to determine the country's new path on the basis of the new Constitution of the Kyrgyz Republic, adopted on May 5, 2021, the "National Spirit – World Heights" Doctrine ("Unguzhol") was approved by the Decree of the President of Kyrgyzstan dated December 18, 2024. This doctrine aims to revive the national values of the Kyrgyz people, to respect national values, and to strengthen national civic feeling. The doctrine also includes ideas aimed at uniting the citizens of the Kyrgyz Republic into a single whole, instilling faith in a bright future, and strengthening civic patriotism and national spirit [9].

The "National Spirit – World Heights" Doctrine of the Kyrgyz Republic (Unguzhol) contains the following principles that embody the spiritual and cultural values of the Kyrgyz people:

Always keep in mind that the Kyrgyz people are a people with rich experience in statehood and governance;

- to consider the free use and study of the language, history, culture, and traditional values of the Kyrgyz people by citizens as a sign of a sovereign country, as well as to present them to the world community;

- to consider spiritual values as a priority, without denying the importance of material values in human life;

- to prevent the opposition of national moral values to religious values;

- to highly value national pride, while not allowing any manifestations of ethnic intolerance;

- to show ethno-tolerance towards the languages, history, and culture of distant and close neighboring peoples;

- to prevent the degradation of the values of other countries, while upholding the dignity of one's own state, and to maintain friendly and good-neighborly relations with neighboring states [10].

Also, the above-mentioned doctrine lists the following as the main values of a Kyrgyz citizen:

The most important value of a Kyrgyz citizen is his homeland, people, and state – the Kyrgyz Republic;

A high, unique level of consciousness of citizens, manifested in a sacred attitude toward the Kyrgyz Republic and its state symbols;

People who, under any circumstances, never break their oaths and are steadfast in the principles of civic patriotism;

Pride of members of society in being Kyrgyz citizens, their high spirit, and creative mood;

A high sense of responsibility for the current state and future of citizens, family, society, and the state, formed on the basis of traditional and modern education and upbringing;

Respect for national spiritual values and traditional and innovative measures to preserve them;

National and ethnocultural codes, rich and vibrant historical and social memory;

Firmness, honesty, and uncompromisingness in protecting justice, equality, honor, and conscience;

Unwavering respect for the culture of behavior, morality, and generosity;

Gentleness toward friends, warmth toward relatives, and harshness toward enemies; the habit of always striving to maintain peace and harmony between people;

A wise attitude toward people based on the principle: "Good for good is everyone's deed; good for evil is a hero's deed; evil for evil is the deed of the narrow-minded; and evil for good is the deed of the blind";

The humanistic and courageous character of a person who always risks his life to save people whose lives are in danger of death for various reasons, regardless of who they are;

Always being ready to do good deeds and to actively participate in the political, economic, and social life of the country;

An endless desire to get an education, master various professions and innovative technologies, and develop the ability to use them;

A culture of careful and rational use of natural resources and the ability to live in harmony with them [10].

The preservation of the spiritual and cultural values of Kyrgyzstan is also included in the National Security Concept of the Kyrgyz Republic, in particular: strengthening peace and harmony among all ethnic groups and confessions, raising the level of legal consciousness and strengthening traditional spiritual and moral values, unity of the Kyrgyz people, respect for the rights and freedoms of the family, man, and citizen, prevention of interethnic, interregional, interfaith, and interreligious conflicts, law and order, legality, a high level of human and intellectual potential, preservation of culture, and traditional spiritual and moral values [11].

Republic of Uzbekistan. The adoption of the new version of the Constitution of the Republic of Uzbekistan in 2023 was followed by the approval of the "Uzbekistan – 2030" Strategy aimed at creating a "New Uzbekistan" [12]. The concept of "New Uzbekistan" in Uzbekistan is based on the motto "Human dignity, the interests of the people are the highest value" [13]. In order to create a "New Uzbekistan", the Development Strategy of New Uzbekistan for 2022–2026 was adopted. This strategy consists of 100 goals aimed at developing various sectors of the country. These include protecting human honor and dignity, implementing the national program "Humane State", increasing the legal culture and legal awareness of the population, ensuring spiritual development,

educating citizens (youth) in the spirit of patriotism, civic responsibility, tolerance, and respect for laws, national and universal values, and developing individuals capable of resisting negative influences and trends; transforming a healthy worldview and creativity in society into a nationwide movement; implementing the concept of "New Uzbekistan – an Enlightened Society"; providing state support for the careful preservation, widespread promotion, and development of national values and spiritual heritage; implementing the national idea of "A Book-Loving Nation"; strengthening the atmosphere of interethnic harmony and religious tolerance in society; etc. [14].

One of the documents adopted for the purpose of creating a new Uzbekistan is the Concept of the Republic of Uzbekistan on Ensuring Freedom of Conscience of Citizens and State Policy in the Religious Sphere in the Republic of Uzbekistan, dated February 25, 2025. This concept is based on the further development of the culture of society, ensuring the harmony and equality of the multinational people of Uzbekistan, and strengthening the legal foundations of statehood [15].

Ensuring the spiritual and cultural security of Uzbekistan is included in the Concept of Public Security of the Republic of Uzbekistan. The list of main national interests in this concept includes the following tasks: comprehensive strengthening of interethnic and interconfessional relations; promoting a culture of religious tolerance, friendship, mutual cooperation, and humanism in society; and strengthening the ability and potential to preserve social identity (language, culture, social system, national mentality, and religion) in the face of constant changes and potential threats arising from their influence, that is, the ability for self-preservation.

Currently, the values in Uzbekistan include loyalty to creative ideas, high responsibility, social justice, humanity, national harmony, the customs and traditions of the Uzbek people, diversity and freedom of worldview, equality of citizens before the law, freedom of conscience, and honest labor. In Uzbekistan, a list of values is presented as follows: respect for parents, cleanliness, kindness, the Uzbek language, religious tolerance, freedom of speech, honesty, mutual assistance, hospitality, and harmony [16].

Republic of Azerbaijan. The Cultural Concept of the Republic of Azerbaijan, the Law of

the Republic of Azerbaijan on Culture, the Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan on National Security, and the Concept of National Security of the Republic of Azerbaijan establish tasks related to the protection of the spiritual and cultural values of Azerbaijan. According to the Cultural Concept of the Republic of Azerbaijan, approved on February 14, 2014, the main values are as follows:

- equality – ensuring the realization of everyone's cultural and creative rights and opportunities on equal terms;
- democracy – educating the population in the spirit of free thought, expanding rights and freedoms in the organization and management of the cultural sphere on a state-public basis, ensuring freedom of aesthetic thought, and encouraging the creation of new cultural organizations;
- humanism – recognizing secular values, the free development of the individual, human rights and freedoms, health and safety, and care for and respect for the environment and people as priorities;
- integration – ensuring the promotion, enrichment, and development of national culture in the world through the adoption of universal human values and world culture, without isolating it from global cultural processes;
- balance – creating a balance between the cultural sphere and the markets for cultural products and services and ensuring the development of the activities of cultural societies;
- quality – ensuring that products and services in the cultural sphere comply with the most advanced standards, norms, socio-economic requirements, and the interests of the individual, society, and the state;
- secularism – ensuring the creation, protection, and development of secular values;
- efficiency – organizing creativity in the cultural sphere using modern methods that are continuously developing, useful, and aimed at achieving the final result;
- inheritance – transferring cultural wealth, knowledge, and experience in this field to future generations [17].

The Concept provides for the implementation of large-scale measures to protect, restore, promote, and disseminate cultural values, including tangible and intangible cultural heritage, as well as the national cultural heritage of Azerbaijan abroad, on the basis of international legal norms.

The Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan on National Security sets out the following tasks

for ensuring the country's national security in the field of culture and spirituality:

- Protecting and developing the cultural heritage, material and spiritual values, means of satisfying cultural needs, and scientific and technical potential of the Azerbaijani people from internal and external threats.
- Protecting and developing the historical and cultural heritage, language, customs and traditions, and national self-consciousness of the Azerbaijani people from external threats.
- Preserving the uniqueness of national culture in the process of globalization of world culture.
- Creating opportunities to use global cultural achievements for the development of national culture.
- Ensuring the protection of historical and cultural monuments of the Republic of Azerbaijan in accordance with international treaties.
- Combating crimes against public morality [18].

The National Security Concept of the Republic of Azerbaijan sets out the following tasks related to the preservation of spiritual and cultural values:

- Preservation of the cultural and historical heritage and spiritual values of the Azerbaijani people, as well as their enrichment with universal values, and the development of their language, identity, patriotic and national pride, and intellectual potential.
- Preservation of the unity of the Azerbaijani people and promotion of the Azerbaijani idea.
- Formation of civil society and ensuring human rights and fundamental freedoms.
- Strengthening the performance of state functions through the development of democratic and civil society institutions, the rule of law, ensuring public order, and protecting the security of the population.
- Strengthening national identity and solidarity based on common values among Azerbaijanis around the world [19].

The Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan on the Protection of Historical and Cultural Monuments was adopted in 1998. This Law regulates relations related to the protection, study, and use of historical and cultural monuments. The law establishes rules for the discovery, registration, protection, restoration, and use of historical and cultural monuments. According to the document, the state ensures the protection of monuments and does not allow their destruction or illegal alteration. The law also

provides for the inclusion of monuments in the state register, the creation of protection zones, and the conduct of scientific research. The duties of state bodies in protecting historical heritage sites, as well as the responsibilities of legal entities and individuals, are defined. According to the law, historical and cultural monuments are considered the national wealth of the people, and their protection is a national duty. This legal document plays an important role in passing on the cultural heritage of Azerbaijan to future generations [20].

The Azerbaijani state has always considered the preservation of the rich material and cultural heritage of the people as one of its priorities. The country has many architectural and cultural monuments reflecting different historical periods. The foundation for the systematic preservation and study of this heritage was laid by Heydar Aliyev. He paid special attention to the preservation of national and cultural values during the Soviet era. After returning to power in 1993, state policy in this area was further strengthened. Azerbaijan's cooperation with UNESCO expanded, and a number of national monuments were included in the international heritage list. During the rule of President Ilham Aliyev, the policy of preserving material and cultural heritage continued. Registration, restoration, and protection of historical monuments are carried out under state control. In addition, many historical monuments have been restored through the Heydar Aliyev Foundation [21]. As a result of the Foundation's activities, the promotion of Azerbaijani culture has been strengthened both domestically and internationally.

After the liberation of the occupied territories of Azerbaijan, including Karabakh and East Zangezur, the restoration of the historical heritage destroyed in these territories has acquired particular importance. Large-scale measures are being taken to restore monuments that were destroyed during the occupation. President Ilham Aliyev pays special attention to the restoration of historical and cultural monuments in the liberated territories. Improving the protection and registration of historical and cultural monuments located in Karabakh and East Zangezur, including the ancient Albanian heritage, is also an important aspect of this policy.

Republic of Turkmenistan. The Decrees of the President of Turkmenistan aimed at preserving cultural heritage sites and immovable

historical monuments of Turkmenistan are intended to increase the effectiveness of control measures in this area and contribute to the development of this sector. In addition, new Laws of Turkmenistan, including “On the Protection, Export and Import of Movable Values of the National Historical and Cultural Heritage,” “On Cinematography,” and “On Folk Art,” aimed at protecting and developing spiritual and cultural values, have been adopted [22].

The Law of Turkmenistan on National Security also sets out the principles of ensuring national security, including the primacy of human and civil rights and freedoms, maintaining a balance of interests between individuals and citizens, society and the state, and their mutual responsibility, as well as monitoring the implementation of the full range of measures to protect national security. In Turkmenistan, the celebration of the “Year of Reverence for Her-

itage, Transformation of the Motherland” was aimed at preserving and developing spiritual and cultural values, preserving and studying historical and cultural heritage, and widely promoting it internationally [23].

Comparative Legal Analysis

During the study, the legal foundations of spiritual and cultural security in Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Uzbekistan, Azerbaijan, and Turkmenistan were compared according to four main criteria: the legal framework, institutional mechanisms, priority values, and implementation mechanisms. The comparative analysis showed that all five states have established constitutional foundations for the protection of spiritual and cultural values, while significant differences remain in their approaches and priorities in legal regulation.

Table 1. Comparative Analysis of the Legal Foundations of Spiritual and Cultural Security in Turkic-Speaking States

State	Legal Framework	Institutional Mechanisms	Priority Values	Key Implementation Features
Kazakhstan	Constitutional norms; legislation on culture and language; state strategic documents	State bodies; cultural and language-policy institutions; National Kurultai and public institutions	National unity, patriotism, language, historical and cultural heritage, hard work, law and order	Priority is given to combining national values with civic identity and unity in a multi-ethnic society
Kyrgyzstan	Constitution; legislation on culture and language; national security and spiritual-cultural development documents	State bodies, cultural institutions, education system, public organizations	National language, historical and spiritual heritage, tradition, patriotism, interethnic and interfaith harmony	Strong direct linkage of spiritual-cultural values with national traditions; spiritual and cultural foundations are enshrined in the Constitution
Uzbekistan	2023 Constitution; legislation on culture, language, and historical-cultural heritage; strategic documents	Public administration bodies; cultural and educational institutions; public organizations	National and universal values, Uzbek language, historical and spiritual heritage, human dignity, national harmony	Emphasis on linking national values with human rights, social harmony, and the state’s social development objectives
Azerbaijan	Constitution; Law on Culture; legislation on protection of historical-cultural heritage and national security	State cultural bodies, heritage-protection institutions, public and local authorities	National cultural identity, Azerbaijani language, historical-cultural heritage, secularism, national consciousness	Cultural heritage is treated as a component of national security, with particular emphasis on protection against internal and external threats
Turkmenistan	Constitution; laws regulating historical-cultural heritage, folk art, and the cultural sphere	State cultural bodies and institutions responsible for protection of historical and cultural heritage	National historical heritage, Turkmen language, tradition, national culture, state unity	The legal framework is characterized by a centralized approach, treating cultural and historical heritage as a direct responsibility of the state

As the table shows, all five states share several core legal directions: protection of the national language and culture, preservation of historical and cultural heritage, strengthening of national identity, and protection of citizens' cultural rights. In Kazakhstan, the Constitution establishes the status of the state language and makes the creation of conditions for the development of the languages of the people of Kazakhstan a state responsibility; cultural legislation also provides legal protection for tangible and intangible cultural values. A distinctive feature of the Kyrgyz legal model is that spiritual and cultural foundations are directly enshrined in a dedicated chapter of the Constitution. The Constitution requires the state to develop the culture of the people, protect historical, material, and spiritual heritage, and ensure interethnic and interfaith harmony, while recognizing citizens' rights to participate in cultural life and access cultural values. In Uzbekistan, particular importance is attached to combining national and universal values. The 2023 Constitution establishes Uzbek as the state language and provides for respect for, and conditions for the development of, the languages, customs, and traditions of all nationalities and ethnic groups in the country. It also defines the protection of historical, spiritual, cultural, scientific, and natural heritage as a shared responsibility of the state and citizens. In Azerbaijan, cultural security is directly linked to national security: cultural legislation regulates the creation, study, promotion, and protection of cultural values, while historical and cultural monuments are protected by a special law; the Constitution also treats the protection of historical and cultural monuments as a duty of every person. In Turkmenistan, the constitutional basis for protecting cultural and historical heritage is closely tied to state responsibility. The Constitution recognizes the preservation of national historical and cultural heritage as a state duty, establishes Turkmen as the state language, guarantees citizens the right to use their mother tongue, and provides for the development of international cooperation in the cultural sphere.

An important result of the comparison is that no single universal model of spiritual and cultural security has emerged across the legal systems of the five states. Instead, each state has formed a legal model corresponding to its historical experience, state structure, ethnode-mographic situation, and specific features of

national identity. Several approaches can nevertheless be distinguished. In Kazakhstan and Uzbekistan, preservation of national values is combined with civic unity, universal values, and social harmony. In Kyrgyzstan, protection of spiritual and cultural values is more directly associated with tradition, historical heritage, and national spirit. In Azerbaijan, cultural security is clearly treated as a component of the national security system. In Turkmenistan, a centralized approach based on direct state responsibility for historical and cultural heritage is predominant. The study therefore shows that the legal foundations of spiritual and cultural security in Turkic-speaking states operate at three interrelated levels: first, the constitutional level establishes fundamental guarantees for the national language, culture, historical heritage, and cultural rights; second, the legislative level implements those constitutional principles through specific legal mechanisms; and third, the institutional level ensures the practical implementation of the established norms.

Conclusion

The comparative legal analysis demonstrates that Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Uzbekistan, Azerbaijan, and Turkmenistan have established constitutional and legislative foundations for ensuring spiritual and cultural security. Common directions across the five legal systems include protecting the status of national languages, preserving historical, cultural, and spiritual heritage, developing national culture, guaranteeing cultural rights, and strengthening national identity. At the same time, the study shows that the legal approaches are not identical in substance. The main difference lies in the level at which spiritual and cultural security is positioned within state legal policy and in the values with which it is associated. In some states, cultural security is closely linked to national unity and civic identity; in others, it is associated with national spirit and tradition, national security, or state protection of historical and cultural heritage.

The comparison further shows that the Kyrgyz model is distinguished by the direct constitutional entrenchment of spiritual and cultural foundations; the Azerbaijani model by linking cultural heritage with national security; the Uzbek model by combining national and universal values; the Kazakh model by connecting national values with civic unity and

social harmony; and the Turkmen model by prioritizing direct state responsibility for protecting historical and cultural heritage. Overall, the comparative study demonstrates that, although Turkic-speaking states share a common value base in the sphere of spiritual and cultural security, their national models of legal institutionalization differ. These differences need not be an obstacle to deeper cultural and legal cooperation; on the contrary, they can provide a basis for mutual exchange of experience and for developing more effective legal mechanisms.

In conclusion, the Turkic-speaking republics that declared independence after the dissolution of the Soviet Union began to preserve their spiritual and cultural values by enshrining them in their Constitutions and laws and by adopting strategic programs, concepts, and doctrines for this purpose. These measures aim to protect national cultures in the process of globalization and transmit them to future generations. Several states have articulated new development trajectories under such formulations as "New Kazakhstan," "New Uzbekistan," and Kyrgyzstan's "Ungu Zhol." One of the important objectives of these concepts and doctrines is the protection and development of spiritual and cultural values.

Funding

This article was prepared within the framework of the scientific project "Socio-Political Processes in Kazakhstan (1980–2020): the Experience of Democratization and the Formation of a Just State".

References

- 1 Abidkhadjaev, U. (n.d.). *Ұлттық құндылықтар туралы*. Institute for Macroeconomic and Regional Studies. https://imrs.uz/publications/articles-and-abstracts/Milliy_qadriyatlar_haqida
- 2 Бурдые, П. (2002). *Формы капитала* (М. С. Добрякова, Пер.; В. В. Радаев, Науч. ред.). *Экономическая социология*, 3(5), 60–74.
- 3 Коньков, А. Е. (2020). Мягкая сила для России: От восприятия к навыкам латентного управления. *Вестник Российского университета дружбы народов. Серия: Политология*, 22(2), 205–221.
- 4 Хобсбаум, Э. (2000). Изобретение традиций. *Вестник Евразии*, (1), 47–62.
- 5 Issayeva, M. (2023). *Orta Asya Türk Devletleri Anayasalarında hukuk devleti anlayışı* [Doktora tezi].
- 6 Қазақстан Республикасының Президенті Қасым-Жомарт Тоқаев. (2022, 16 наурыз). *Қазақстан халқына Жолдауы*. <https://www.akorda.kz/kz/memleket-basshysy-kasym-zhomart-tokaevtyin-kazakistan-halkyna-zholdauy-1622340>

7 Қазақстан Республикасының Президенті Қасым-Жомарт Тоқаев. (2025, 14 наурыз). *Ұлттық құрылтайдың төртінші отырысында сөйлеген сөзі*. <https://www.akorda.kz/kz/memleket-basshysy-kasym-zhomart-tokaevtyin-ulttyk-kuryltaydyn-tort-inshi-otyrasynda-soylegen-sozi-14242>

8 Тоқаев, Қ.-Ж. (n.d.). *Бірлік пен ынтымақ – ешқашан ескірмейтін құндылық: Мемлекет басшысы Қасым-Жомарт Тоқаевтың Қазақстан халқы Ассамблеясының XXXIII сессиясындағы сөйлеген сөзі. Егемен Қазақстан*. <https://egemen.kz/article/363195-qasym-zhomart-toqaev-birlik-pen-ynymaq-%E2%80%93-eshqashan-eskirmeytin-qundilyq>

9 Указ Президента Кыргызской Республики № 369 от 18 декабря 2024 года о Доктрине (Унгузюл) «Национальный дух – мировые высоты». (2024). <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/230019498/edition/23327/ru>

10 Доктрина Кыргызской Республики «Национальный дух – мировые высоты», утвержденная Указом Президента Кыргызской Республики № 369 от 18 декабря 2024 года. (2024). <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/18-11/edition/23328/ru>

11 Концепция национальной безопасности Кыргызской Республики: Указ Президента Кыргызской Республики № 570 от 20 декабря 2021 г. (2021). <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/430815/edition/1118046/ru>

12 Указ Президента Республики Узбекистан «О Стратегии "Узбекистан – 2030"». (n.d.). <https://www.lex.uz/ru/docs/6600404>

13 Мухитдинова, Ф. А. (n.d.). *Ценностно-гуманистическое обоснование прав человека в обновленной Конституции Узбекистана*. https://constitution.uz/ru/pages/inson_huquqlari

14 Приложение № 1 к Указу Президента Республики Узбекистан от 28 января 2021 года № УП–60 «Стратегия развития нового Узбекистана на 2022–2026 годы». (2021). https://drive.google.com/file/d/1pEQ_76aEjTfFnV_PD1zEulz8jWfntMr6/view

15 Закон Республики Узбекистан «Об утверждении концепции обеспечения свободы совести граждан и государственной политики в религиозной сфере в Республике Узбекистан». (2025). <https://lex.uz/uz/docs/7404926>

16 Приложение № 1м к Указу Президента Республики Узбекистан № ПП–27 от 29 ноября 2021 г. «Концепция общественной безопасности Республики Узбекистан». (2021). https://nrm.uz/contentf?doc=676813_konceptiya_obshchestvennoy_bezопасnosti_respubliki_uzbekistan_%28prilozhenie_n_1_k_ukazu_prezidenta_ruz_ot_29_11_2021_g_n_up-27=1odatva_27%29&product_stistanvse

17 Azərbaycan Respublikasının Mədəniyyət Konsepsiyası. (2014). <https://e-qanun.az/framework/27056>

18 Milli təhlükəsizlik haqqında Azərbaycan Respublikasının Qanunu. (n.d.). <https://e-qanun.az/framework/5455>

19 Azərbaycan Respublikasının milli təhlükəsizlik konsepsiyası. (2007). <https://e-qanun.az/framework/13373>

20 Tarix və mədəni abidələrini qorunması haqqında Azərbaycan Respublikasının Qanunu. (n.d.). <https://e-qanun.az/framework/3526>

21 Yaqubov, Y. (n.d.). *Abidaların qorunması xalqımızın mədəni irsə sevgisindən xəbər verir. Azərbaycan Xəbərləri*. <https://www.azerbaijan-news.az/az/posts/detail/abidelerin-qorunmasi-xalqimizin-medeni-irse-sevgisinden-xeber-verir-1713393912>

22 Закон Туркменистана от 4 мая 2013 года № 388-IV «О национальной безопасности Туркменистана» (с изменениями и дополнениями по состоянию на 16.03.2023 г.). (2013). https://online.zakon.kz/Document/?doc_id=32126544&pos=9;-49#pos=9;-49

23 Государственное стимулирование и законодательная поддержка – ключевые аспекты концепции культурной политики. (n.d.). <https://turkmenistan.gov.tm/index.php/ru/post/27729/gosudarstvennoe-stimulirovanie-i-zakonodatel'naya-podderzhka-%E2%80%93-klyuchevye-aspekty-kontseptsii-kulturnoi-politiki>

Transliteration

1 Abidkhadjiev, U. (n.d.). *Milliy qadriyatlar haqida* [On national values]. Institute for Macroeconomic and Regional Studies. https://imrs.uz/publications/articles-and-abstracts/Milliy_qadriyatlar_haqida (In Uzbek)

2 Bourdieu, P. (2002). *Formy kapitala* [Forms of capital] (M. S. Dobryakova, Trans.; V. V. Radaev, Ed.). *Ekonomicheskaya sotsiologiya*, 3(5), 60–74. (In Russian)

3 Kon'kov, A. E. (2020). *Myagkaya sila dlya Rossii: Ot vospriyatiya k navykam latentnogo upravleniya* [Soft power for Russia: From perception to latent governance skills]. *Vestnik Rossiyskogo universiteta druzhby narodov. Seriya: Politologiya*, 22(2), 205–221. (In Russian)

4 Khobsbaum, E. (2000). *Izobretenie traditsiy* [The invention of tradition]. *Vestnik Evrazii*, (1), 47–62. (In Russian)

5 Issayeva, M. (2023). *Orta Asya Türk Devletleri Anayasalarında hukuk devleti anlayışı* [The concept of the rule of law in the constitutions of the Central Asian Turkic states] [Doctoral dissertation]. (In Turkish)

6 Qazaqstan Respublikasynyñ Prezidenti Qasym-Jomart Toqayev. (2022, March 16). *Qazaqstan halqyna Joldaýy* [Address to the people of Kazakhstan]. <https://www.akorda.kz/kz/memleket-basshysy-kasym-zhomart-tokaevtyñ-kazakstan-halkyna-zholdauy-1622340> (In Kazakh)

7 Qazaqstan Respublikasynyñ Prezidenti Qasym-Jomart Toqayev. (2025, March 14). *Ülttyq quryltaydyñ törtinshi otyrasynda soylegen sözi* [Speech at the fourth meeting of the National Kurultai]. <https://www.akorda.kz/kz/memleket-basshysy-kasym-zhomart-tokaevtyñ-ulttyq-kuryltaydyn-tortinshi-otyrasynda-soylegen-sozi-14242> (In Kazakh)

8 Toqayev, Q.-Zh. (n.d.). *Birlik pen yntymagh – eşqaşan eskirmeitin qundylyq: Memleket basshysy Qasym-Jomart Toqayevtyñ Qazaqstan halqy Assambleyasynyñ XXXIII sessiyasyndağy söylegen sözi* [Unity and solidarity are values that never become outdated: Speech by Head of State Kassym-Jomart Tokayev at the XXXIII session of the Assembly of the People of Kazakhstan]. *Egemen Qazaqstan*. <https://egemen.kz/article/363195-qasym-zhomart-toqayev-birlik-pen-yntymaq-%E2%80%93-esqashan-eskirmeytin-qundylyq> (In Kazakh)

9 Ukaz Prezidenta Kyrgyzskoy Respubliki № 369 ot 18 dekabrya 2024 goda o Doktrine (Unguzhol) «Natsional'nyy dukh – mirovoye vysoty» [Decree of the President of the Kyrgyz Republic No. 369 of December 18, 2024, on the Doctrine (Unguzhol) "National Spirit – World Heights"]. (2024). <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/230019498/edition/23327/ru> (In Russian)

10 Doktrina Kyrgyzskoy Respubliki «Natsional'nyy dukh – mirovoye vysoty», utverzhennaya Ukazom Prezidenta Kyrgyzskoy Respubliki № 369 ot 18 dekabrya 2024 goda [Doctrine of the Kyrgyz Republic "National Spirit – World Heights," approved by Decree No. 369 of the President of the Kyrgyz Republic of December 18, 2024]. (2024). <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/18-11/edition/23328/ru> (In Russian)

11 Kontseptsiya natsional'noy bezopasnosti Kyrgyzskoy Respubliki: Ukaz Prezidenta Kyrgyzskoy Respubliki № 570 ot 20 dekabrya 2021 g. [National Security Concept of the Kyrgyz Republic: Decree No. 570 of the President of the Kyrgyz Republic of December 20, 2021]. (2021). <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/430815/edition/1118046/ru> (In Russian)

12 Ukaz Prezidenta Respubliki Uzbekistan «O Strategii "Uzbekistan – 2030"» [Decree of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan "On the Uzbekistan–2030 Strategy"]. (n.d.). <https://www.lex.uz/ru/docs/6600404> (In Russian)

13 Mukhitdinova, F. A. (n.d.). *Tsennostno-gumanisticheskoe obosnovanie prav cheloveka v obnovlennoy Konstitutsii Uzbekistana* [Value-based and humanistic justification of human rights in the revised Constitution of Uzbekistan]. https://constitution.uz/ru/pages/inson_huquqlari (In Russian)

14 Prilozhenie № 1 k Ukazu Prezidenta Respubliki Uzbekistan ot 28 yanvarya 2021 goda № UP–60 «Strategiya razvitiya novogo Uzbekistana na 2022–2026 gody» [Appendix No. 1 to Decree No. UP–60 of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan of January 28, 2021, "Development Strategy for 2022–2026"]. (2021). https://drive.google.com/file/d/1pEQ_76aEjjTF-nV_PD1zEulz8jWfmr6/view (In Russian)

15 Zakon Respubliki Uzbekistan «Ob utverzhdenii kontseptsii obespecheniya svobody sovesti grazhdan i gosudarstvennoy politiki v religioznoy sfere v Respublike Uzbekistan» [Law of the Republic of Uzbekistan "On Approval of the Concept for Ensuring Freedom of Conscience of Citizens and State Policy in the Religious Sphere in the Republic of Uzbekistan"]. (2025). <https://lex.uz/uz/docs/7404926> (In Russian)

16 Prilozhenie № 1m k Ukazu Prezidenta Respubliki Uzbekistan № PP-27 ot 29 noyabrya 2021 g. «Kontseptsiya obshchestvennoy bezopasnosti Respubliki Uzbekistan» [Appendix No. 1m to Decree No. PP-27 of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan of November 29, 2021, "Concept of Public Security of the Republic of Uzbekistan"]. (2021). https://nrm.uz/content?doc=676813_koncepciya_obshchestvennoy_bezopasnosti_respubliki_uzbekistan_%28prilozhenie_n_1_k_ukazu_prezidenta_ruz_ot_29_11_2021_g_n_up-27=1odatvza_27%29&product_stistanvse (In Russian)

17 Azərbaycan Respublikasının Mədəniyyət Konsepsiyası [Cultural Concept of the Republic of Azerbaijan]. (2014). <https://e-qanun.az/framework/27056> (In Azerbaijani)

18 Milli təhlükəsizlik haqqında Azərbaycan Respublikasının Qanunu [Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan on National Security]. (n.d.). <https://e-qanun.az/framework/5455> (In Azerbaijani)

19 Azərbaycan Respublikasının milli təhlükəsizlik konsepsiyası [National Security Concept of the Republic of Azerbaijan]. (2007). <https://e-qanun.az/framework/13373> (In Azerbaijani)

20 Tarix və mədəni abidələrin qorunması haqqında Azərbaycan Respublikasının Qanunu [Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan on the Protection of Historical and Cultural Monuments]. (n.d.). <https://e-qanun.az/framework/3526> (In Azerbaijani)

21 Yaqubov, Y. (n.d.). *Abidələrin qorunması xalqımızın mədəni irsə sevgisindən xəbər verir* [Protection of monuments demonstrates our people's love for cultural heritage]. *Azərbaycan Xəbərləri*. <https://www.azerbaijan-news.az/az/posts/detail/abidelerin-qorunmasi-xalqimizin-medeni-irse-sevgisinden-xeber-verir-1713393912> (In Azerbaijani)

22 *Zakon Turkmenistana ot 4 maya 2013 goda № 388-IV «O natsional'noy bezopasnosti Turkmenistana»*

(s izmeneniyami i dopolneniyami po sostoyaniyu na 16.03.2023 g.) [Law of Turkmenistan No. 388-IV of May 4, 2013, "On National Security of Turkmenistan" (as amended and supplemented as of March 16, 2023)]. (2013). https://online.zakon.kz/Document/?doc_id=32126544&pos=9;-49#pos=9;-49 (In Russian)

23 *Gosudarstvennoe stimulirovanie i zakonodatel'naya podderzhka – klyucheveye aspekty kontseptsii kul'turnoy politiki* [State incentives and legislative support: Key aspects of the concept of cultural policy]. (n.d.). <https://turkmenistan.gov.tm/index.php/ru/post/27729/gosudarstvennoe-stimulirovanie-i-zakonodatel-naya-podderzhka-%E2%80%93-klyucheveye-aspekty-kontseptsii-kulturnoi-politiki> (In Russian)

Author Contributions

M.I. Issayeva - conceptualization, methodology, and supervision. E.N. Chermukhambetov - literature review, and analysis. D.D. Yeshpanova - interpretation of results, and drafting of the manuscript. A.R. Abdiyeva - literature review, editing.

INFORMATION ABOUT AUTHORS

Meiramkul Issayeva

PhD, International Vision University, Gostivar, North Macedonia, email: meiramkul.issayeva@vision.edu.mk, ORCID ID: 0000-0003-3207-2706

Erlan Chermukhambetov

Researcher, PhD student, Institute for Philosophy, Political Science and Religious Studies of the CS MSHE RK, Almaty, Kazakhstan, email: erlan_chen@mail.ru, ORCID ID: 0000-0003-1727-5775

Dina Yeshpanova

Leading Researcher. Associate Professor, Candidate of Philosophical Sciences, Institute for Philosophy, Political Science and Religious Studies of the CS MSHE RK, Almaty, Kazakhstan, email: d.yehpanova@inbox.ru, ORCID ID: 0009-0006-3795-3245

Roza Abdiyeva

Senior Lecturer, Candidate of Philosophical Sciences, Kazakh-Russian Medical University, Almaty, Kazakhstan, email: roza_kkz@mail.ru, ORCID ID: 0009-0006-2266-1493

Мейрамкул Ибадуллақызы Исаева

PhD, Халықаралық Визион университеті, Гостивар, Солтүстік Македония, email: meiramkul.issayeva@vision.edu.mk, ORCID ID: 0000-0003-3207-2706

Ерлан Нұрмұхаметұлы
Чермухамбетов

ғылыми қызметкер, PhD докторант, ҚР ҒЖБМ ҒК Философия, саясаттану және дінтану институты, Алматы, Қазақстан, email: erlan_chen@mail.ru, ORCID ID: 0000-0003-1727-5775

Дина Далабайқызы Ешпанова

жетекші ғылыми қызметкер, қауымдастырылған профессор, философия ғылымдарының кандидаты, ҚР ҒЖБМ ҒК Философия, саясаттану және дінтану институты, Алматы, Қазақстан, email: d.yehpanova@inbox.ru, ORCID ID: 0009-0006-3795-3245

Роза Серікбайқызы Әбдиева

аға оқытушы, философия ғылымының кандидаты, Қазақстан-Ресей Медициналық Университеті, Алматы, Қазақстан, email: roza_kkz@mail.ru, ORCID ID: 0009-0006-2266-1493

Мейрамкул Ибадуллаевна Исаева

PhD, Международный университет Визион, Гостивар, Северная Македония, email: meiramkul.issayeva@vision.edu.mk, ORCID ID: 0000-0003-3207-2706

Ерлан Нурмухаметович
Чермухамбетов

научный сотрудник, PhD докторант, Институт философии, политологии и религиоведения КН МНВО РК, Алматы, Казахстан, email: erlan_chen@mail.ru, ORCID ID: 0000-0003-1727-5775

Дина Далабаевна Ешпанова

ведущий научный сотрудник, ассоциированный профессор, кандидат философских наук, Институт философии, политологии и религиоведения КН МНВО РК, Алматы, Казахстан, email: d.yehpanova@inbox.ru, ORCID ID: 0009-0006-3795-3245

Роза Серикбаевна Абдиева

старший преподаватель, кандидат философских наук, Казахско-российский медицинский университет, Алматы, Казахстан, email: roza_kkz@mail.ru, ORCID ID: 0009-0006-2266-1493